Appendix I

ELLIS Engineering Inc.
Consulting Engineers
214 Martindale Road, Suite 201
St. Catharines, Ontario Canada
L2S 0B2

Tel: (905) 934-9049
Web: www.ellis.on.ca

March 18, 2024

The Town of Niagara-On-The-Lake
1593 Four Mile Creek Road,
P.O. Box 100, Virgil, ON
L0S 1T0

Attention: **Bryan McMillan, C.Tech.**
Engineering Technologist

Reference: **Contract No. 2024-959: Dorchester Street Culvert Replacement**
Tender Analysis
Our File No. 959

We have reviewed the tenders opened for the above mentioned project and confirm that Rankin Construction Inc. of St. Catharines, Ontario, is the lowest bidder with a total Contract price of $668,604.00 excluding H.S.T.

We confirm that the contractor has met all the criteria in the bid submission, as set out in the instructions to bidders, and recommend that the contract be awarded to Rankin Construction Inc.

Yours truly,

ELLIS Engineering Inc.

Duane VanGeest, P.Eng.

Project Manager

Attachments: - *Tender Analysis Spreadsheet dated March 18, 2024.*

TOWN OF NIAGARA-ON-THE LAKE
Contract No. 2024-959
Dorchester Street Culvert Replacement
ELLIS Engineering Job No: 959
March 18, 2024

Item No.	Item Description	Estimated Quantity	Unit	Estimated Cost		CRL Campbell		KADA Group		O'Hara Trucking and Excavating		Peter's Excavating Inc.		Rankin Construction Inc.		Contractor Bid Analysis		
				Unit Price	Total	Unit Price	Total	Unit Price	Total	Unit Price	Total	Unit Price	Total	Unit Price	Total	MIN	AVE	MAX
1	Mobilization and Demobilization	100%	L.S.	-	$ 30,000.00	-	$ 16,500.00	-	$ 13,250.00	-	$ 14,000.00	-	$ 70,000.00	-	$ 7,500.00	$ 7,500.00	$ 24,250.00	$ 70,000.00
2	Construction Layout	100%	L.S.	-	$ 5,000.00	-	$ 4,840.00	-	$ 4,500.00	-	$ 7,500.00	-	$ 3,000.00	-	$ 4,500.00	$ 3,000.00	$ 4,868.00	$ 7,500.00
3	Preconstruction Survey	100%	L.S.	-	$ 1,500.00	-	$ 1,860.00	-	$ 1,500.00	-	$ 15,300.00	-	$ 3,500.00	-	$ 2,850.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 5,002.00	$ 15,300.00
4	Construction Schedule	100%	L.S.	-	$ 1,000.00	-	$ 500.00	-	$ 750.00	-	$ 1,200.00	-	$ 8,000.00	-	$ 125.00	$ 125.00	$ 2,115.00	$ 8,000.00
5	Waterway Protection and Dewatering	100%	L.S.	-	$ 30,000.00	-	$ 47,000.00	-	$ 4,325.99	-	$ 65,000.00	-	$ 60,000.00	-	$ 35,000.00	$ 4,325.99	$ 42,265.20	$ 65,000.00
6	Fish Salvage and Transfer	100%	L.S.	-	$ 500.00	-	$ 2,230.00	-	$ 1,450.00	-	$ 5,500.00	-	$ 15,000.00	-	$ 435.00	$ 435.00	$ 4,923.00	$ 15,000.00
7	Tree Protection	100%	L.S.	-	$ 1,000.00	-	$ 1,260.00	-	$ 3,300.00	-	$ 3,600.00	-	$ 7,500.00	-	$ 200.00	$ 200.00	$ 3,172.00	$ 7,500.00
8	Heavy Duty Silt Fence Barrier	100%	L.S.	-	$ 1,500.00	-	$ 1,200.00	-	$ 4,390.00	-	$ 3,600.00	-	$ 10,000.00	-	$ 865.00	$ 865.00	$ 4,011.00	$ 10,000.00
9	Construction Signs, Traffic Control, and Management Plan	100%		-	$ 7,500.00	-	$ 5,740.00	-	$ 14,500.00	-	$ 9,680.00	-	$ 25,000.00	-	$ 4,025.00	$ 4,025.00	$ 11,789.00	$ 25,000.00
10	Removal of Asphalt Pavement	425	m^2	$ 10.00	$ 4,250.00	$ 14.50	$ 6,162.50	$ 13.50	$ 5,737.50	$ 8.00	$ 3,400.00	$ 15.00	$ 6,375.00	$ 3.50	$ 1,487.50	$ 1,487.50	$ 4,632.50	$ 6,375.00
11	Removal of Existing Structure	100%	L.S.		$ 15,000.00	-	$ 2,240.00	-	$ 4,200.00	-	$ 11,715.00	-	$ 20,000.00	-	$ 11,000.00	$ 2,240.00	$ 9,831.00	$ 20,000.00
12	Excavation and Grading															$ -		$ -
	a) Excavation	1530	m^3	$ 25.00	$ 38,250.00	$ 54.50	$ 83,385.00	$ 14.50	$ 22,185.00	$ 46.00	$ 70,380.00	$ 118.00	$ 180,540.00	$ 33.00	$ 50,490.00	$ 22,185.00	$ 81,396.00	$ 180,540.00
	b) Soil Management Tracking	100%	L.S.	-	$ 2,000.00	-	$ 3,100.00	-	$ 20,000.00	-	$ 14,300.00	-	$ 7,000.00	-	$ 1,750.00	$ 1,750.00	$ 9,230.00	$ 20,000.00
	c) Flo Tracking Software	3	Mnths	$ 600.00	$ 1,800.00	$ 620.00	$ 1,860.00	$ 525.00	$ 1,575.00	$ 500.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 500.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 575.00	$ 1,725.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 1,632.00	$ 1,860.00
13	Concrete in Apron Walls	100%	L.S.	-	$ 7,000.00	-	$ 13,700.00	-	$ 21,500.00	-	$ 11,000.00	-	$ 12,960.00	-	$ 7,565.00	$ 7,565.00	$ 13,345.00	$ 21,500.00
14	Concrete in Structure	100%	L.S.	-	$ 66,000.00	-	$ 107,100.00	-	$ 13,500.00	-	$ 88,000.00	-	$ 116,640.00	-	$ 74,500.00	$ 13,500.00	$ 79,948.00	$ 116,640.00
15	Concrete in Distribution Slab	100%	L.S.	-	$ 22,500.00	-	$ 16,000.00	-	$ 18,200.00	-	$ 13,750.00	-	$ 14,985.00	-	$ 10,500.00	$ 10,500.00	$ 14,687.00	$ 18,200.00
16	Supply and Installation of Precast Concrete Box Culvert	100%	L.S.	-	$ 240,000.00	-	$ 195,000.00	-	$ 295,105.89	-	$ 275,000.00	-	$ 295,900.00	-	$ 110,000.00	$ 110,000.00	$ 234,201.18	$ 295,900.00
17	Reinforcing Steel	3.5	t	$ 3,500.00	$ 12,250.00	$ 5,760.00	$ 20,160.00	$ 2,500.00	$ 8,750.00	$ 7,150.00	$ 25,025.00	$ 1,981.80	$ 6,936.30	$ 5,350.00	$ 18,725.00	$ 6,936.30	$ 15,919.26	$ 25,025.00
18	Glass Fibre Reinforced Polymer (GFRP) Bars	100%	L.S.	-	$ 15,000.00	-	$ 4,270.00	-	$ 5,000.00	-	$ 19,800.00	-	$ 4,390.00	-	$ 9,100.00	$ 4,270.00	$ 8,512.00	$ 19,800.00
19	Dowels into Concrete	150	Ea.	$ 20.00	$ 3,000.00	$ 36.50	$ 5,475.00	$ 67.89	$ 10,183.50	$ 31.00	$ 4,650.00	$ 16.20	$ 2,430.00	$ 34.00	$ 5,100.00	$ 2,430.00	$ 5,567.70	$ 10,183.50
20	Subdrains	70	m	$ 45.00	$ 3,150.00	$ 59.50	$ 4,165.00	$ 15.00	$ 1,050.00	$ 100.00	$ 7,000.00	$ 125.00	$ 8,750.00	$ 34.00	$ 2,380.00	$ 1,050.00	$ 4,669.00	$ 8,750.00
21	Granular 'A'	1982	t	$ 30.00	$ 59,460.00	$ 33.00	$ 65,406.00	$ 27.60	$ 54,703.20	$ 35.00	$ 69,370.00	$ 32.80	$ 65,009.60	$ 32.00	$ 63,424.00	$ 54,703.20	$ 63,582.56	$ 69,370.00
22	Granular 'M'	40	t	$ 20.00	$ 800.00	$ 84.50	$ 3,380.00	$ 33.99	$ 1,359.60	$ 80.00	$ 3,200.00	$ 88.00	$ 3,520.00	$ 78.00	$ 3,120.00	$ 1,359.60	$ 2,915.92	$ 3,520.00
23	Geotextile	150	m^2	$ 8.00	$ 1,200.00	$ 4.50	$ 675.00	$ 11.50	$ 1,725.00	$ 10.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 18.88	$ 2,832.00	$ 13.50	$ 2,025.00	$ 675.00	$ 1,751.40	$ 2,832.00
24	Rip-Rap	65	t	$ 100.00	$ 6,500.00	$ 160.00	$ 10,400.00	$ 44.00	$ 2,860.00	$ 205.00	$ 13,325.00	$ 125.00	$ 8,125.00	$ 137.50	$ 8,937.50	$ 2,860.00	$ 8,729.50	$ 13,325.00
25	Concrete Grout	100%	L.S.	-	$ 5,000.00	-	$ 16,700.00	-	$ 3,500.00	-	$ 12,230.00	-	$ 4,500.00	-	$ 5,745.00	$ 3,500.00	$ 8,535.00	$ 16,700.00
26	River stone	50	m^2	$ 75.00	$ 3,750.00	$ 68.00	$ 3,400.00	$ 45.00	$ 2,250.00	$ 92.00	$ 4,600.00	$ 90.00	$ 4,500.00	$ 105.00	$ 5,250.00	$ 2,250.00	$ 4,000.00	$ 5,250.00
27	Waterproofing	90	m^2	$ 150.00	$ 13,500.00	$ 99.50	$ 8,955.00	$ 112.00	$ 10,080.00	$ 200.00	$ 18,000.00	$ 200.00	$ 18,000.00	$ 115.00	$ 10,350.00	$ 8,955.00	$ 13,077.00	$ 18,000.00
28	Steel Beam Guiderail and Posts	50	m	$ 500.00	$ 25,000.00	$ 990.00	$ 49,500.00	$ 874.00	$ 43,700.00	$ 875.00	$ 43,750.00	$ 874.50	$ 43,725.00	$ 905.00	$ 45,250.00	$ 43,700.00	$ 45,185.00	$ 49,500.00
29	Pedestrian Hand Railing	100%	L.S.	-	$ 8,000.00	-	$ 17,900.00	-	$ 15,840.00	-	$ 15,840.00	-	$ 16,840.00	-	$ 16,500.00	$ 15,840.00	$ 16,584.00	$ 17,900.00
30	Hot Mix Asphalt Paving																	$ -
	a) HL3 HS	45	t	$ 250.00	$ 11,250.00	$ 500.00	$ 22,500.00	$ 350.00	$ 15,750.00	$ 360.00	$ 16,200.00	$ 358.50	$ 16,132.50	$ 188.00	$ 8,460.00	$ 8,460.00	$ 15,808.50	$ 22,500.00
	b) HL8 HS	60	t	$ 250.00	$ 15,000.00	$ 370.00	$ 22,200.00	$ 330.00	$ 19,800.00	$ 330.00	$ 19,800.00	$ 344.00	$ 20,640.00	$ 215.00	$ 12,900.00	$ 12,900.00	$ 19,068.00	$ 22,200.00
31	Permanent Markings															$ -		$ -
	a) Stop Bar	2	Ea.	$ 500.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 1,180.00	$ 2,360.00	$ 600.00	$ 1,200.00	$ 275.00	$ 550.00	$ 1,100.00	$ 2,200.00	$ 570.00	$ 1,140.00	$ 550.00	$ 1,490.00	$ 2,360.00
32	Topsoil and Sod	400	m^2	$ 20.00	$ 8,000.00	$ 17.50	$ 7,000.00	$ 16.00	$ 6,400.00	$ 16.00	$ 6,400.00	$ 18.40	$ 7,360.00	$ 15.00	$ 6,000.00	$ 6,000.00	$ 6,632.00	$ 7,360.00
33	Removal of Existing CSP's and Concrete Pipe	100%	L.S.	-	$ 4,000.00	-	$ 2,400.00	-	$ 1,000.00	-	$ 3,500.00	-	$ 8,000.00	-	$ 4,120.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 3,804.00	$ 8,000.00
34	Cross Culvert Replacement																	$ -
	a) 375mm HDPE	100%	L.S.	-	$ 5,000.00	-	$ 4,900.00	-	$ 6,475.00	-	$ 5,100.00	-	$ 6,000.00	-	$ 7,000.00	$ 4,900.00	$ 5,895.00	$ 7,000.00
35	Support and Removal of Existing 375 Dia Sanitary Sewer	100%	L.S.	-	$ 8,000.00	-	$ 1,650.00	-	$ 1,480.00	-	$ 9,600.00	-	$ 50,000.00	-	$ 16,645.00	$ 1,480.00	$ 15,875.00	$ 50,000.00
36	375 Dia. Sanitary Sewer	11	m	$ 600.00	$ 6,600.00	$ 1,020.00	$ 11,220.00	$ 630.00	$ 6,930.00	$ 2,500.00	$ 27,500.00	$ 2,248.00	$ 24,728.00	$ 1,665.00	$ 18,315.00	$ 6,930.00	$ 17,738.60	$ 27,500.00
37	Watermain Relocation and Insulation	100%	L.S.		$ 10,000.00	-	$ 46,000.00	-	$ 15,914.89	-	$ 65,500.00	-	$ 48,870.00	-	$ 47,100.00	$ 15,914.89	$ 44,676.98	$ 65,500.00
38	Temporary Water Supply	100%	L.S.		$ 2,000.00	-	$ 14,100.00	-	$ 2,000.00	-	$ 500.00	-	$ 6,000.00	-	$ 3,535.00	$ 500.00	$ 5,227.00	$ 14,100.00
39	600mm x 600mm Precast Concrete Single Catch Basin	1	Ea.	$ 5,000.00	$ 5,000.00	$ 3,810.00	$ 3,810.00	$ 3,490.00	$ 3,490.00	$ 3,000.00	$ 3,000.00	$ 4,500.00	$ 4,500.00	$ 3,825.00	$ 3,825.00	$ 3,000.00	$ 3,725.00	$ 4,500.00
40	300mm Single Catch Basin Lead, PVC DR-35	10	m	$ 400.00	$ 4,000.00	$ 555.00	$ 5,550.00	$ 340.00	$ 3,400.00	$ 480.00	$ 4,800.00	$ 698.00	$ 6,980.00	$ 555.00	$ 5,550.00	$ 3,400.00	$ 5,256.00	$ 6,980.00
41	CB Shield for Catch Basins	1	Ea.	$ 2,000.00	$ 2,000.00	$ 1,750.00	$ 1,750.00	$ 735.00	$ 735.00	$ 2,000.00	$ 2,000.00	$ 3,500.00	$ 3,500.00	$ 1,485.00	$ 1,485.00	$ 735.00	$ 1,894.00	$ 3,500.00
42	Hydro Allowance	100%	L.S.		$ 500.00	-	$ 2,500.00	-	$ 1,500.00	-	$ 2,500.00	-	$ 8,000.00	-	$ 2,250.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 3,350.00	$ 8,000.00
43	Bell Allowance	100%	L.S.		$ 5,000.00	-	$ 2,800.00	-	$ 1,000.00	-	$ 3,500.00	-	$ 10,000.00	-	$ 2,250.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 3,910.00	$ 10,000.00
44	Cogeco Allowance	100%	L.S.		$ 500.00	-	$ -	-	$ 1,000.00	-	$ 2,500.00	-	$ 10,000.00	-	$ 995.00	$ -	$ 2,899.00	$ 10,000.00
45	Enbridge Allowance	100%	L.S.		$ 5,000.00	-	$ 4,000.00	-	$ 1,000.00	-	$ 3,500.00	-	$ 10,000.00	-	$ 2,250.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 4,150.00	$ 10,000.00
46	Maintain and Support Utility Poles (Provisional)	100%	L.S.		$ 500.00	-	$ 2,500.00	-	$ 1,000.00	-	$ 2,400.00	-	$ 4,000.00	-	$ 4,360.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 2,852.00	$ 4,360.00
		TOTAL:		**$**	**724,760.00**	**$**	**877,303.50**	**$**	**701,045.57**	**$**	**1,031,565.00**	**$**	**1,294,368.40**		**$668,604.00**	**$ 411,502.48**	**$ 914,577.29**	**$ 1,448,330.50**